

**Synopsis of the September 20, 2007 Meeting of the  
Program, Finance and Administration Committee (PFAC) of the  
New York Metropolitan Transportation Council (NYMTC)**

**A. CALL TO ORDER, INTRODUCTIONS AND REMARKS**

1. The meeting was called to order by Mr. Peter G. King, Director of Program, Planning and Management for the New York State Department of Transportation. Mr. King said that he was filling in as the Chairperson of the Program, Finance, and Administration Committee (PFAC). Mr. King said that NYMTC was busy over the summer working on the Unified Planning Work Program, the Regional Transportation Plan and the Transportation Improvement Program.

**2. NYMTC Executive Director's Report**

Mr. Joel Ettinger announced that the PFAC meeting was being broadcast live on the web for the first time. The meeting can be viewed by going to the webcast link on NYMTC's website ([www.NYMTC.org](http://www.NYMTC.org)). Mr. Ettinger said that a Special Council Meeting will be held on September 27, 2007, where the NYMTC Principals would be able to interact with four knowledgeable experts in the field of transportation and to hear their views of what they think are the critical issues affecting re-authorization of the federal transportation program. He said there will be dialogue with the Principals, the public and the four speakers—Lillian Borrone of the Eno Foundations, Ann Canby of the Surface Transportation Policy Partnership, William Millar of the American Public Transportation Association and Cameron Moore of the National Association of Regional Councils. Mr. Ettinger said that the first follow-up conference to last year's forum, "Good to Go – Transit Options for Older Adults", was scheduled to be held on October 23, 2007 at SUNY Old Westbury. Mr. Ettinger announced the next conference in NYMTC's series that addressed its theme, "Challenges of Growth", would be held on November 13, 2007 at New York University in Manhattan. The conference called, "Thinking Bigger: New York Transportation in the Northeast Megaregion", recognized the need to look at issues at a larger scale. Mr. Ettinger said that PFAC would not take action on the Transportation Improvement Program because of last minute issues, but comments were welcomed during the public participation segment of the meeting. He announced there would be a September 11<sup>th</sup> Memorial Program brown bag session held in the NYMTC conference rooms on September 21, 2007.

**B. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

Mr. Murray Bodin, Concerned Grandparents, talked about making current small changes to help benefit the future and tomorrow leaders. He spoke about conserving energy, promoting less congestion and preserving the greenery on the roadways.

Ms. Christine Berthet read parts from a letter that was sent to NYMTC from Manhattan Community Board #4 commenting on the 2008-2012 Transportation Improvement Program and Conformity Determination.

Mr. George Haikalis said that after 25 years, NY-NJ-CT metropolitan areas remained without a cooperative regional transportation planning process and without an informal alliance of the ten metropolitan planning organizations to deal with the problems of growing congestion, greenhouse gas emissions and long term economic viability. Mr. Haikalis said that a misallocation of scarce transport resources had become a result of this disconnect by deciding to develop deep cavern railway terminal stations in midtown Manhattan. Mr. Haikalis said that it was time for the three

Governors to call for an expansion of the New York City Traffic Mitigation Commission to become the legitimate metropolitan planning organization required for the region to qualify for federal funds. He said that NYMTC could mark the 25<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the dissolution of Tri-State with a renewed commitment to move forward with a three-state regional planning process, and produce a plan that would deal with the key problems facing the region.

**D. ACTION ITEMS**

**1. Accept: June 21, 2007 Meeting Synopsis**

A motion to accept the June 21, 2007 Meeting Synopsis was made by Mr. Lawrence Berger, representing the Nassau/Suffolk Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Mr. Samuel Hornick, representing the New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee. The meeting synopsis was unanimously accepted.

**2. Adopt: Resolution #240 – Amendment to the 2007-2008 Unified Planning Work Program to Amend Nassau County Projects**

Mr. Gerry Bogacz said, at the request of Nassau County, the resolution would adjust five of Nassau County's projects in the Unified Planning Work Program and no new dollars would be used.

A motion to adopt Resolution #240, Amendment to the 2007-2008 Unified Planning Work Program to Amend Nassau County Projects was made by Mr. Lawrence Berger, representing the Nassau/Suffolk Transportation Coordinating Committee, and seconded by Mr. Samuel Hornick, representing the New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee. The resolution was unanimously approved.

**3. Adopt: Resolution #241 – Recognition of Service by Dr. James Yarmus, Rockland County Planning Department and Public Transportation**

Mr. Alan Borenstein said that PFAC wanted to recognize a member who had retired and would no longer be a part of the committee. Mr. Borenstein read the resolution giving recognition to Dr. James Yarmus and wished him good luck.

A motion to adopt Resolution #241, Recognition of Service by Dr. James Yarmus, Rockland County Planning Department and Public Transportation was made by Mr. Patrick Gerdin, representing the Mid-Hudson South Transportation Coordination Committee, and seconded by Mr. Robert Shinnick, representing the Nassau/Suffolk Transportation Coordinating Committee. The resolution was unanimously approved.

**4. Adopt: Resolution #242 – Recognition of Service by Ms. Gwen Perlman, New York City Department of Transportation**

Mr. Alan Borenstein said that PFAC was recognizing a member who was leaving the New York City Department of Transportation to continue her career with the City University of New York. Mr. Borenstein read the resolution giving recognition to Ms. Gwen Perlman and wished her good luck.

A motion to adopt Resolution #242, Recognition of Service by Ms. Gwen Perlman, New York City Department of Transportation was made by Mr. Joseph Barr, representing the New York

City Transportation Coordination Committee, and seconded by Mr. Lawrence Berger, representing the Nassau/Suffolk Transportation Coordinating Committee. The resolution was unanimously approved.

Ms. Gwen Perlman accepted her token of appreciation and said that it was wonderful working with everyone.

**E. NYMTC at 25 Years: A DISCUSSION WITH PAST NYMTC EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS**

Four former NYMTC Executive Directors gave a synopsis of their tenure with NYMTC.

Mr. David Phraner served as NYMTC's Executive Director from 1982-1983. Mr. Phraner came directly from Tri-State and talked about the beginning development of NYMTC—transitioning from Tri-State to NYMTC. He said some of their goals and challenges were to try to keep the rail transportation system intact, bringing the system to a state of good repair, and to coordinate and integrate the transportation system. Mr. Phraner said he would like to see seamless changes made within his life time.

Mr. William Wheeler, who was NYMTC's Executive Director from 1983-1986, talked about his term with NYMTC. He said that he began when there wasn't much cooperation within the state agencies. The states' finances were not good and ways were sought to generate money. Mr. Wheeler said what made NYMTC work then and now were personal relationships and maintaining friendships. He said the more you know someone the better you will be able to achieve your objectives. He said NYMTC was and still is tops with its staff. He said people are devoted to their craft. He said that NYMTC made huge progress and everyone should be proud. The work being done is great and it's being recognized.

Mr. James Harris, who served as the Executive Director from 1997-1999, said that when he came to NYMTC it was "smooth sailing" in comparison. Mr. Harris said that one of the first tasks he had to address was the conditional certification review received from the federal agencies. He said that many working groups were created that engaged public participation. He said that he and his staff changed the concept of how money was allocated to the member agencies in the Unified Planning Work Program by shifting talks about money to talks about projects, activities, data collection and planning. Mr. Harris said that NYMTC is a wonderful organization with a wonderful history and is doing a wonderful job. He enjoyed working with the staff and all the members.

Mr. Tom Schulze was NYMTC Executive Director from 1999-2003. Mr. Schulze talked about things NYMTC possessed that stood out to him. He said he valued NYMTC's contribution to the region through modeling, data collection, website access, utilizing the Best Practices Model, and providing a common source of information for doing regional planning. Mr. Schulze said that regional planning was important and he gained much respect for the Council, members and staff—those who were involved with the process. He said it was important to have a place where agencies and the public could come to talk about transportation issues that go beyond one agency's responsibility. Mr. Schulze said that he valued the staff of NYMTC. He called them serious, professional and underpaid. He talked about how the staff came together, after September 11, 2001, to rebuild the process, the products, and the files. He said the staff put things back on track for NYMTC and he was proud he worked with them.

**E. CONFIRMATION OF SPECIAL COUNCIL MEETING**

Mr. Peter King confirmed that a Special Council Meeting will be held on Thursday, September 27, 2007 at 1:00 p.m., and will be held at the Borough of Manhattan Community College, Tribeca Performing Arts Center located at 199 Chambers Street, Theatre 2, in New York City.

**F. CONFIRMATION OF NEXT PFAC MEETING**

Mr. Peter King confirmed that the next meeting of the Program, Finance, and Administration Committee was scheduled to be held on Thursday, November 15, 2007 at 1:15 p.m., and will be held at the NYMTC office located at 199 Water Street, 22<sup>nd</sup> floor, New York City.

**G. ADJOURN**

The meeting was adjourned approximately at 3:30 p.m.

**IN ATTENDANCE**

**Voting Member/Alternates**

Mr. Joseph Barr, NYC Department of Transportation  
Mr. Lawrence Berger, Nassau County  
Mr. Patrick Gerdin, Rockland County  
Mr. Samuel Hornick, NYC Department of City Planning  
Mr. Peter King, NYS Department of Transportation  
Ms. Naomi Klein, Westchester County  
Mr. John Pilner, Putnam County  
Ms. Sarah Rios, Metropolitan Transportation Authority  
Mr. Robert Shinnick, Suffolk County

**Advisory (non-voting) Members**

Mr. James Goevia, Federal Transit Administration  
Mr. Lou Venech, Port Authority of New York and New Jersey  
Ms. Melanie Zeman, US Environmental Protection Agency

**NYMTC Council Staff**

Gerry Bogacz	Maria Garcia	Dawn Moore
Juilette Bergman	Anthony Gawrych	Munnesh Patel
Alan Borenstein	Steve Hausch	Mohamed Rashid
Kuo-Ann Chiao	Jerry Jonassen	Karen Rosenberger
Thusitha Chandra	Michael LaPorta	Chad Wilcomb
Joel Ettinger	Uchenna Madu	Carol Wilkinson
Emma Gaitan	Ella Mathews	

**OTHERS**

James Anderson  
Christine Berthet, CB#4  
Murray Boudin, Concerned Grandparents  
Paul Gessner, PANYNJ  
Todd Goldman, UTRC/City College  
Leon Goodman, Transportation Consultant  
George Haikalis, IRUM  
James Harris  
Joseph Jarrin, NYCDOT  
Gwen Perlman, NYCDOT  
David Phraner, Jacobs, Edwards & Kelcey  
Tom Schulze, NJT  
Jack Schmidt, NYCDCP  
Lou Sepersky, Metroeast  
Ray Tomezaly, STV  
Mary Vogel  
William Wheeler, MTA

Respectfully submitted,

*Andrea' Miles-Cole*